

Power Sharing at the Local Level: Evidence on Opting-in for Non-Citizen Voting Rights

Alois Stutzer[‡] Michaela Slotwinski[†]

October 31, 2020

Supplementary Material

Table of Contents

A	Non-citizen voting rights in the canton of Grisons	1
A.1	Clause on non-citizen voting rights in the constitution of the canton of Grisons	1
A.2	Example quotes from the official protocols of the parliamentary debate on non-citizen voting rights	2
B	List of municipalities in the canton of Grisons that adopted non-citizen voting rights (NCVR) by January 1, 2017	4
C	Proposed changes to the constitution of the canton of Zurich in the two initiatives on an opting-in regime of non-citizen voting rights	7
D	List of variables for the canton of Grisons	9
E	Descriptive statistics for the two data sets	18
F	Characteristics of foreigners and non-citizen voting rights in the cantons of Grisons and Zurich	22

[‡] Alois Stutzer, University of Basel, Faculty of Business and Economics, Peter Merian-Weg 6, 4002 Basel, Switzerland. Phone: +41 (0)61 207 33 61, email: alois.stutzer@unibas.ch. (Corresponding author)

[†] Michaela Slotwinski, University of Basel, Faculty of Business and Economics, Peter Merian-Weg 6, 4002 Basel, Switzerland. Phone: +41 (0)61 207 33 75, email: michaela.slotwinski@unibas.ch.

A Non-citizen voting rights in the canton of Grisons

As there are no official translations into English, we provide our own excerpt of the constitution and some related sections of the parliamentary protocols.

A.1 Clause on non-citizen voting rights in the constitution of the canton of Grisons

Article 9, point 4

⁴ In accordance with municipal law, the municipalities may grant Swiss nationals abroad and foreign nationals the right to vote and the right to stand as a candidate in municipal matters.

Artikel 9, Ziffer 4

⁴ Die Gemeinden können nach Massgabe des kommunalen Rechts Auslandschweizerinnen und Auslandschweizern beziehungsweise Ausländerinnen und Ausländern das Stimmrecht sowie das aktive und passive Wahlrecht in Gemeindeangelegenheiten erteilen.

A.2 Example quotes from the official protocols of the parliamentary debate on non-citizen voting rights

The debate took place in the cantonal parliament (Grosser Rat) in the capital Chur on June 18, 2002.

Arquint: "We are thus de-dramatizing the problem of citizenship. We can use it to introduce intermediate stages in which families who have lived here for at least ten years can become involved in public affairs with the right to vote and decide like anyone else. They pay taxes, like everyone else, and they share responsibility for the welfare of this municipality and of the canton. What would make more sense than to give them voting responsibility as well?"

Arquint: "Wir entdramatisieren damit das Problem der Staatsbürgerschaft. Wir können damit Zwischenstufen einlegen, in dem sich Familien, die seit mindestens zehn Jahren hier wohnhaft sind, sich mit dem Stimm- und Wahlrecht in die öffentlichen Angelegenheiten einmischen können wie jede und jeder andere auch. Sie bezahlen Steuern, wie jeder und jede andere auch, sie sind mitverantwortlich an der Wohlfahrt dieser Gemeinde und auch des Kantons. Was wäre sinnvoller, als sie dann eben auch in Pflicht zu nehmen."

Arquint: "In addition, 35 percent of the foreign resident population are young people under the age of 25. And what could be better as an integration model than making them discharging their duties, in which we grant them the right to vote."

Arquint: "Dazu kommt, dass 35 Prozent der ausländischen Wohnbevölkerung Jugendliche unter 25 Jahren sind. Und was gibt es hier diesen gegenüber besseres als Integrationsmodell als die "In- Pflichtnahme", in dem wir ihnen das Stimm- und Wahlrecht gewähren."

Luzi: "The municipality knows its situation regarding the integration of foreign women and men; it can determine and no one else. I ask you to really support this proposal. You will thus also relieve the pressure on naturalization a little bit."

Luzi: "Die Gemeinde kennt Ihre Situation bezüglich Integration der Ausländerinnen und Ausländer, sie kann bestimmen und niemand anders. Ich bitte Sie diesen Vorschlag wirklich zu unterstützen. Sie nehmen damit auch den Druck auf Einbürgerungen ein bisschen weg."

Walther: "What is the foreigner's motivation to become a citizen if he can have these rights in another way?"

Walther: "Was hat denn der Ausländer noch für ein Willen, Bürger zu werden, wenn er die Rechte auch sonst haben kann."

Feltscher: "Felsberg made a total revision of its constitution a year ago. In its new constitution, Felsberg has postulated voting rights for foreign residents in such a way that we could introduce them as soon as the cantonal constitution permits. This was undisputed in our municipality and was decided at a municipal assembly and - mind you - not at the ballot box."

Feltscher: "Felsberg hat vor einem Jahr eine Totalrevision der Verfassung gemacht. Felsberg hat in seiner neuen Verfassung das Stimmrecht für niedergelassene Ausländer so postuliert, dass wir es einführen könnten, so bald die Kantonsverfassung dies zulässt. Das war unumstritten in unserer Gemeinde und ist an einer Gemeindeversammlung und –wohlverstanden – nicht an einer Urne beschlossen worden."

Zindel: "I believe that the active right to vote and participate in politics, in addition to the right to pay taxes, which foreigners also have, is a very important achievement of integration. We must certainly step up naturalization. But in this way, we must also involve those who have settled down in our country in local responsibility."

Zindel: "Ich meine einfach, dass das aktive Stimm- und Wahlrecht, neben den Rechten wie Steuern zu bezahlen, die die Ausländer auch haben, eine ganz wichtige Integrationsleistung darstellen. Wir müssen sicher die Einbürgerungen forcieren. Wir müssen aber auch auf diesem Weg, Menschen in die Verantwortung einbinden, die bei uns sesshaft geworden sind."

Member of the governing council Widmer-Schlumpf: "It is obviously a need of different communities to have more room for manoeuvre in this area."

Regierungsrätin Widmer-Schlumpf: "Es ist offensichtlich ein Bedürfnis verschiedener Gemeinden, dass sie in diesem Bereich einen grösseren Handlungsspielraum bekommen."

Cahannes Renggli: "If we look at the consultation process, we can see that there is general agreement on this paragraph 4. Davos was not the only one to express a positive opinion on this; 64% of the municipalities voted in favor of paragraph 4."

Cahannes Renggli: "Wenn wir die Vernehmlassung anschauen, sehen wir, dass zu diesem Absatz 4 eine generelle Zustimmung besteht. Nicht nur Davos hat sich positiv dazu geäußert, sondern 64 Prozent der Gemeinden haben ihre Zustimmung zu diesem Absatz 4 gemacht."

B List of municipalities in the canton of Grisons that adopted non-citizen voting rights (NCVR) by January 1, 2017

Albula/Alvra: Introduced in 2015 as per the merger of the seven former municipalities Alvaneu, Tiefencastel, Mon, Surava, Brienz/Brinzauls, Stierva and Alvaschein. None of these municipalities had NCVR before. *Source:* Avenir Suisse (2015, 19) and email correspondence with municipality of Albula/Alvra.

Arosa: Introduced in 2013 as per the merger of the nine former municipalities Arosa, Castiel, Calfreisen, Lüen, Molinis, Peist, Langwies, Pagig and St. Peter. Calfreisen already had NCVR. *Source:* Avenir Suisse (2015, 19), Eidgenössische Kommission für Migrationsfragen EKM (2010) as well as email and mail correspondence with the municipality of Arosa.

Bever: Introduced in 2006. *Source:* Avenir Suisse (2015, 19) and amendment to the constitution of Bever on December 12, 2005.

Bonaduz: Introduced in 2005 via municipal assembly. *Source:* Avenir Suisse (2015, 19) and minutes of the municipal assembly No. 01/05 on March 7, 2005.

Bregaglia: Introduced in 2009/10 as per the merger of the five former municipalities Bondo, Soglio, Castasegna, Vicosoprano and Stampa. *Source:* Avenir Suisse (2015, 19) and Reformiert - Bündner Kirchenbote (2015, Nr.5, p.4).

Casti-Wergenstein: Introduced in 2012. *Source:* Avenir Suisse (2015, 19)

Cazis: Introduced in 2012 as per the merger of the five former municipalities Cazis, Tartar, Sarn, Präz and Portein. Portein and Cazis already had NCVR. Tartar had previously declined an NCVR vote. *Source:* Avenir Suisse (2015, 19, 29) and Eidgenössische Kommission für Migrationsfragen EKM (2010)

Conters im Prättigau: Introduced via municipal assembly in 2002 as the first municipality in the canton of Grisons. It was to come into force as soon as the superordinate cantonal law allowed. *Source:* Avenir Suisse (2015, 19) and municipality constitution of Conters im Prättigau, decided on March 1, 2002, commencement on March 28, 2002.

Domleschg: Introduced in 2012 as per the merger of the eight former municipalities Pratval, Rodels, Paspels, Almens, Feldis/Veulden, Scheid, Tumegl/Tomils and Trans. None of the former municipalities already had NCVR. *Source:* Avenir Suisse (2015, 19, 29)

Donat: Introduced in 2007. *Source:* Avenir Suisse (2015, 19, 29)

Fideris: Introduced in 2005. *Source:* Avenir Suisse (2015, 19, 29)

Flerden: Introduced in 2012 via the municipal assembly. *Source:* Avenir Suisse (2015, 19, 29) and constitution of the municipality of Flerden of March 30, 2012.

Jenaz: Introduced in 2013 via the municipal assembly. *Source:* Avenir Suisse (2015, 19, 29) and amendment of the constitution of the municipality of Jenaz, June 13, 2013.

Luzein: Introduced in 2016 as per the merger of the former municipalities Luzein and St. Antönien. NCVR was part of the new merger contract of March 2015. St. Antönien had already had NCVR since 2012. NCVR was suggested by the interim council and accepted by the municipal assembly in accepting the merger contract. *Source:* Avenir Suisse (2015, 19, 27-29), merger contract between Luzein and St. Antönien, March 24, 2015 as well as correspondence with the municipality administration of Luzein.

Masein: Introduced in 2004 via the municipal assembly. *Source:* Avenir Suisse (2015, 19) and adjustment of the constitution of the municipality of Masein, October 22, 2004.

Safiental: Introduced in 2013 as per the merger of the former four municipalities Tenna, Safien, Valendas and Versam. Introduction implemented via acceptance of the merger contract by the municipal assembly. None of the former municipalities had NCVR before. *Source:* Avenir Suisse (2015, 19, 29) and email and mail correspondence with the municipality of Safiental as well as the merger contract of November 25, 2011.

Sagogn: Introduced in 2010 via municipal assembly. *Source:* Avenir Suisse (2015, 19) and the adjustment to the constitution of Sagogn, March 27, 2009.

Scuol: Introduced via ballot box in 2015 as part of the merger of the six municipalities Guarda, Sent, Scuol, Tarasp, Ftan and Ardez. The former municipality Ftan had already had NCVR since 2006. *Source:* Avenir Suisse (2015, 19, 29) as well as email and mail correspondence with the municipality of Scuol and the constitution of Scuol, approved at the ballot on August 24, 2014.

Sils im Domleschg: Introduced in 2009. *Source:* Avenir Suisse (2015, 19)

Sumvitg: Introduced in 2009. *Source:* Avenir Suisse (2015, 19)

Surses: Introduced by ballot referendum in 2016 via the merger of the nine former municipalities Salouf, Savognin, Sur, Cunter, Bivio, Tinizong-Rona, Mulegns, Marmorera and Riom-Parsonz. *Source:* Constitution of Surses, approved at the ballot on August 16, 2015.

Tschappina: Introduced in 2008 via municipal assembly. *Source:* Constitution of Surses, approved at

the ballot box on August 16, 2015. *Source:* Avenir Suisse (2015, 19) and constitution of Tschappina, accepted by the municipal assembly on June 9, 2008.

Vals: Introduced in 2015 as per the merger of Vals and St. Martin. The former municipality Vals had already had NCVR since 2012. In former Vals, NCVR was introduced by a project group, approved at the ballot box in the course of supporting the municipality's complete constitutional revision. *Source:* Avenir Suisse (2015, 19, 29) and correspondence with the municipality administration of Vals as well as constitution of Vals, approved at the ballot on January 29, 2012.

C Proposed changes to the constitution of the canton of Zurich in the two initiatives on an opting-in regime of non-citizen voting rights

1993: Volksinitiative “für ein fakultatives Ausländerstimmrecht auf Gemeindeebene”

unverändert Art. 50 Abs. 1: Die politischen Rechte in der Gemeinde werden von den Stimmberechtigten ausgeübt, die in ihr politischen Wohnsitz haben. In bürgerlichen Angelegenheiten besitzen nur die Gemeindebürger, in den Kirchgemeinden nur die Angehörigen der betreffenden Kirche politische Rechte.

neu Abs. 2: Die Gemeinden sind befugt, den Ausländern, die in ihnen Wohnsitz haben und seit fünf Jahren die Niederlassungsbewilligung besitzen, die politischen Rechte in Gemeindeangelegenheiten zu übertragen.

1993: Popular initiative “for optional non-citizen voting rights at the municipal level”

unchanged Art. 50 para. 1: The political rights in the municipality are exercised by the voters who have their political residence in the municipality. In civil matters, only the citizens of the municipality have political rights; in parishes only the members of the church concerned have political rights.

new para. 2: Municipalities are authorized to transfer political rights in municipal matters to resident foreigners who have held a residence permit for five years.

2013: Volksinitiative “Für mehr Demokratie (fakultatives Stimm- und Wahlrecht für Ausländerinnen und Ausländer auf Gemeindeebene)”

unverändert Art. 22 Abs. 1: Das Stimm- und Wahlrecht und die weiteren politischen Rechte im Kantons- und Gemeindeangelegenheiten stehen allen Schweizerinnen und Schweizern zu, die im Kanton wohnen, das 18. Lebensjahr zurückgelegt haben und in eidgenössischen Angelegenheiten stimmberechtigt sind.

neu Abs. 2: Die Gemeinden können die politischen Rechte in Gemeindeangelegenheiten ausserdem für Ausländerinnen und Ausländern vorsehen, die seit mindestens 10 Jahren in der Schweiz leben und seit mindestens 3 Jahren ununterbrochen in der Gemeinde wohnen und die es persönlich beantragen.

2013: Popular initiative “For more democracy (optional voting rights for foreigners at the municipal level)”

unchanged Art. 22 para. 1: All Swiss citizens residing in the canton who have reached the age of 18 and who are entitled to vote in federal matters have the right to vote and other political rights in cantonal and municipal matters.

new para. 2: The municipalities may also provide for political rights in municipal matters for foreign nationals who have lived in Switzerland for at least 10 years, have lived in the municipality for at least 3 years without interruption and who apply for them in person.

D List of variables for the canton of Grisons

Demographic data regarding the year 2000 is drawn from the Swiss census in 2000 and is provided by the Swiss Federal Statistical Office. Data after 2000 is derived from ESPOP, which provides yearly updates of the census data. The latter dataset does not generally include specific demographic details on the municipal level, but only with regard to gender and Swiss nationality. As from 2010, detailed demographic information is available from the Swiss population register (STATPOP) of the Swiss Federal Statistical Office.

Municipality characteristics measured before January 1, 2004, and involving municipalities that merged by January 1, 2004, are included as a weighted sum, whereby the weights refer to the population in the year the characteristic was measured.³⁰ Municipality characteristics measured after January 1, 2004, and involving municipalities that were part of a merger since the beginning of 2004 are attributed to all municipalities as they existed on January 1, 2004.³¹ Further details regarding the specification of the explanatory variables are provided in Table D.1.

Table D.1: Description of variables

Variable	Description
<i>Socio-economic composition</i>	
Frac. age 0 to 34 (%)	People aged 34 years and younger as a percentage of the total population in 2000. <i>Source:</i> www.pxweb.bfs.admin.ch .
Frac. age 65+ (%)	People aged 65 years and older as a percentage of the total population in 2000. <i>Source:</i> www.pxweb.bfs.admin.ch .

– continued on next page –

³⁰We use population weights in the case of absolute as well as in the case of percentage values if values correspond to a date before January 1, 2004. This is particularly relevant for data from the census in 2000. For any data concerning a year before 2000, we adopt population weights referring to the year 2000, as no population weights are available for the years before. This is relevant for the vote on women’s suffrage in 1971, where the municipality status corresponds to the year 1971.

³¹In detail, this means that datasets with absolute values are population weighted by the population status in 2004. Datasets with percentage values are not population weighted for values after January 1, 2004. In this case, each municipality of the year 2004 is assigned the same value. In addition to percentage values after January 1, 2004, there is no weighting on indicator variables.

Table D.1 – continued

Frac. low educated (%)	Swiss residents with a lower educational level as a percentage of all Swiss residents in 2000. To create the group of less educated Swiss residents, the originally 13 education categories were divided into 3 subgroups, i.e., "less educated" (no completed education or compulsory minimum education), "professional education" (intermediate diploma school/vocational school, apprenticeships/full time vocational school, Matura school, teaching seminar, higher vocational education, institute of higher vocational education) and "high education" (university, university of applied sciences, higher education institution). Not reported entries: school-age children, as well as those younger than school-age are excluded. <i>Source:</i> www.pxweb.bfs.admin.ch .
Frac. unemployed (%)	The variable represents the fraction of unemployed Swiss as a percentage of unemployed and employed Swiss in 2000. Inactive individuals as well as individuals younger than 15 years are excluded. <i>Source:</i> www.pxweb.bfs.admin.ch .
Frac. with high income (%)	The variable measures the fraction of individuals within the highest class of taxable income as a percentage of the individuals in all classes of taxable income. Taxation corresponds to the direct federal tax in the taxation period 2003. Special taxation cases are excluded. <i>Source:</i> www.estv.admin.ch
<i>Power dilution</i>	
Ln(population size)	Natural logarithm of the permanent resident population as per December 2003 (status: August 2004). The data was collected via ESPOP (1981-2010). This is an updated statistic of the latest population census. <i>Source:</i> Department of Statistics at the Agency for Economic Development and Tourism, Grisons, www.awt.gr.ch .

– continued on next page –

Table D.1 – continued

Frac. foreigners (%)	Foreign permanent residents as a percentage of the total permanent resident population as per December 2003 (status: August 2004). The data was collected via ESPOP (1981-2010). This is an updated statistic of the latest population census. <i>Source:</i> Department of Statistics at the Agency for Economic Development and Tourism, Grisons, www.awt.gr.ch .
Municipal parliament (D)	The variable municipal parliament indicates whether the municipality's legislative form is a municipal parliament (value 1) or a municipal assembly (value 0). Some municipalities with a parliament also have a municipal assembly. This type of legislative form is coded as municipal parliament (value 1). <i>Source:</i> Bureau of Municipalities, Grisons, www.afg.gr.ch .
Municipality merger (D)	The variable municipality merger indicates whether the municipality was involved in a merger with one or more other municipalities (value 1). In the case of no merger, the variable is set to 0. <i>Source:</i> Document "Entwicklung der Anzahl Gemeinden Graubündens", retrieved from Bureau of Municipalities, Grisons, www.afg.gr.ch . Supplemental information from the constitutions of affected municipalities.
<i>Characteristics of foreigners</i>	
Frac. foreigners high (D)	Fraction of foreigners high is an indicator variable capturing municipalities with a high fraction of foreigners. It is equal to one if the municipality's fraction of foreigners is higher than the median value of the fraction of foreigners of all municipalities and zero otherwise. The data was collected via ESPOP (1981-2010). This is an updated statistic of the latest population census. <i>Source:</i> Department of Statistics at the Agency for Economic Development and Tourism, Grisons, www.awt.gr.ch .

– continued on next page –

Table D.1 – continued

Frac. low edu. f. high (D)	Fraction of low-educated foreigners high is an indicator variable equal to one if the fraction of low-educated foreigners, as a percentage of all foreigners in 2000, is higher than the median value of the fraction of low educated foreigners of all municipalities. Otherwise it is equal to zero. Low-educated foreigners are foreigners with low educational attainment. To create the group of foreigners with low education, the originally 13 education categories were divided into three subgroups, i.e., "minimum education" (no completed education or compulsory minimum education), "vocational education" (intermediate diploma school/vocational school, apprenticeships/-full time professional school, Matura school, teaching seminar, higher professional education, institute of higher vocational education), "high education" (university, university of applied sciences, higher education institution). Not reported entries: school-age children, as well as those younger than school-age were excluded. <i>Source:</i> www.pxweb.bfs.admin.ch.
Frac. unempl. f. high (D)	Fraction of unemployed foreigners high is an indicator variable set to one if the fraction of unemployed foreigners (as a percentage of unemployed plus employed foreigners) in 2000 is higher than the median value of the fraction of unemployed foreigners of all municipalities. Otherwise it is equal to zero. Inactive persons as well as kids under age 15 are excluded. <i>Source:</i> www.pxweb.bfs.admin.ch.

– continued on next page –

Table D.1 – continued

Frac. low skilled f. high (D)	Fraction of low skilled foreigners high is an indicator variable set to one if the fraction of low skilled foreigners (as a percentage of all jobs of foreigners) in 2000 is higher than the median value of the fraction of low skilled foreigners of all municipalities and to zero otherwise. The fraction of low skilled foreigners is the number of "non-skilled foreigners" as a percentage of all foreigners' socio-professional categories. The socio-professional categories include the following 12 elements: highest management, freelancer, other self-employed, academic jobs/higher management, intermediate jobs, qualified non-manual jobs, qualified manual jobs, non-skilled workers, unemployed people, inactive persons, children up to age 15 as well as workers who could not be allocated. <i>Source:</i> www.pxweb.bfs.admin.ch.
-------------------------------	--

– continued on next page –

Table D.1 – continued

Frac. f. speak local lang. high (D)	Fraction of foreigners speaking local language high is an indicator variable set to one if the fraction of foreigners who speak at least one of the municipality's main languages (as a percentage of all foreigners) in 2000 is higher than the median value of the fraction foreigners who speak at least one of the municipality's main languages. In all other cases it is equal to zero. A municipality can have a single main language or more than one main language. The main language is defined according to the language population percentage ratios to be found in "Botschaft der Regierung an den Grossen Rat, Sprachengesetz des Kantons Graubünden, Issue No. 2, 2006-2007" (Retrieved from: www.gr.ch/Botschaften/2006/2_2006.pdf). The default language is Swiss German. Municipalities with 20 to 49.9% of their population speaking Romansh (or Italian) are defined as their multilingual Swiss German/Romansh or Italian/Romansh municipalities (or Swiss German/Italian, Italian/Romansh). Municipalities with 50% or more of their population speaking Romansh (or Italian, Swiss German) are defined as Romansh (or Italian, Swiss German) single language municipalities. An exception arises when the historical language in the municipality is a different one (e.g., St. Moritz with 58.3% of its population speaking Italian is defined as a multilingual (Swiss German/Italian) municipality. The absolute number of foreigners who speak at least one of the municipality's main languages is defined as follows: A Romansh speaking person is counted full (value 1) if he/she is in a Romansh municipality. If he/she is in an Italian or Swiss German/Italian multilingual municipality, he/she is counted half (value 1/2) due to the high similarity of the languages Romansh and Italian. Romansh speaking people are defined as not speaking the main language if they are in a fully Swiss German municipality (value 0). The procedure is analogous for the other languages. The fraction of foreigners who speak at least one of the municipality's main languages is the sum of the absolute values as a percentage of all the foreigners in 2000. <i>Source:</i> www.pxweb.bfs.admin.ch.
-------------------------------------	---

Table D.1 – continued

Minority experience

Frac. temp. foreign. (%)	The variable measures the fraction of foreigners with a non-permanent residence permit as a percentage of the municipality's total population in 2010. Non-permanent residents are foreigners holding a residence permit with a duration of less than 12 months. <i>Source:</i> www.pxweb.bfs.admin.ch .
Frac. Protestants (%)	The variable reflects the number of Protestants relative to the total population in 2000. <i>Source:</i> www.pxweb.bfs.admin.ch .
Frac. Italian speaking (%)	The variable corresponds to the fraction of Italian speaking Swiss people relative to the total population in 2000. <i>Source:</i> www.pxweb.bfs.admin.ch .
Frac. Romansh speaking (%)	The variable corresponds to the fraction of Romansh speaking Swiss people relative to the total population in 2000. <i>Source:</i> www.pxweb.bfs.admin.ch .
Walser municipality (D)	Walser is an indicator variable equal to one if the municipality has a Walser origin. This holds for the following municipalities Parpan, Schmitten, Gräsch, Vals, Saas, Nufenen, Castiel, Tschappina, Wiesen, St. Martin, Tenna, Safien, St. Antönien Ascharina, Hinterrhein, Medels im Rheinwald, Furna, Avers, Mitten, Malix, Sufers, Trimmis, Peist, St. Antönien, Says, St. Peter, Lüen, Langwies, Calfreisen, Arosa, Churwalden, Versam, Valzeina, Klosters-Serneus, Davos, Fanas, Molinis, Pagig, Praden, Obersaxen, Splügen, Valendas. Otherwise the value is zero. <i>Source:</i> www.pxweb.bfs.admin.ch . Supplemental information retrieved from: www.walseralps.eu , www.myswitzerland.com , www.walserverein-gr.ch , www.gemeindearosa.ch , www.gruesch.ch , www.wikipedia.org .

– continued on next page –

Table D.1 – continued

Political preferences

Frac. Social Democratic Party (%)	The variable corresponds to the fraction of people who voted for the Social Democratic Party in the general elections for the National Council in 2003. <i>Source:</i> www.pxweb.bfs.admin.ch .
Frac. Swiss People’s Party (%)	The variable corresponds to the fraction of people who voted for the Swiss People’s Party in the general elections for the National Council in 2003. <i>Source:</i> www.pxweb.bfs.admin.ch .
Frac. female suffrage (1971) (%)	The variable corresponds to the fraction of men who voted in favor of women’s enfranchisement on the national level (German: eidgenössisches Frauenstimm- und Wahlrecht) in 1971. <i>Source:</i> www.pxweb.bfs.admin.ch .
Frac. voting age 18 (1991) (%)	The variable corresponds to the fraction of people who voted in favor of lowering the voting age to 18 (German: Stimm- und Wahlrechtsalter 18) in 1991. <i>Source:</i> www.pxweb.bfs.admin.ch .

– continued on next page –

Table D.1 – continued

Reservation towards immigrants (1 st PC of PCA)	The variable is the first principal component of a principal component analysis over 13 votes. The respective vote outcomes are recoded such that higher shares indicate stronger reservations towards immigration and/or immigrants. Our set of vote outcomes includes the following popular votes: law on foreigners (1982, German: Ausländergesetz, pc loading: 0.2176), equal citizenship (1983, German: Gleichberechtigung im Bürgerrecht, pc loading: 0.3344), naturalization of young foreigners (1983, German: Einbürgerung junger Ausländer, pc loading: 0.3225), asylum law (1987, German: Asylgesetz, pc loading: -0.1195), restriction on immigration (1988, German: Begrenzung der Einwanderung, pc loading: 0.2793), facilitated naturalization of young foreigners (1994, German: Erleichterte Einbürgerung junger Ausländer, pc loading: 0.3723), coercive measures for law on foreigners (1994, German: Zwangsmassnahmen im Ausländerrecht, pc loading: -0.0866), asylum law (1999, German: Asylgesetz, pc loading: -0.2061), urgent measures in the area of asylum and foreigners (1999, German: Dringliche Massnahmen im Asyl- und Ausländerbereich, pc loading: -0.1728), regulation of immigration (2000, German: Für eine Regelung der Zuwanderung, pc loading: 0.3890), against abuse of the asylum law (2002, German: Gegen Asylrechtsmissbrauch, pc loading: 0.2735), facilitated naturalization of young second generation immigrants (2004, German: Erleichterte Einbürgerung junger Ausländerinnen und Ausländer der zweiten Generation, pc loading: 0.2595), citizenship by birth for third generation foreigners (2004, German: Bürgerrechtserwerb durch Geburt bei der dritten Generation, pc loading: 0.3642). <i>Source:</i> www.pxweb.bfs.admin.ch.
---	--

E Descriptive statistics for the two data sets

Table E.1: Descriptive statistics for the canton of Grisons

	Mean	Std. dev.	Min	Max
Dependent variable				
Voting right for non-citizens adopted by 2017 [0/100]	34.135	47.531	0	100
Independent / control variables				
Socio-economic composition				
Frac. age 0 to 34	0.412	0.059	0.198	0.536
Frac. age 65+	0.187	0.062	0.059	0.426
Frac. low educated	0.350	0.104	0.161	0.727
Frac. unemployed	0.018	0.017	0	0.094
Frac. high income	0.145	0.072	0	0.372
Power dilution				
Ln(population size)	5.875	1.258	3.135	10.381
Frac. foreigners	0.079	0.068	0	0.321
Municipality merger	0.587	0.494	0	1
Municipal parliament	0.072	0.259	0	1
Characteristics of foreigners				
Frac. low educated f.	0.386	0.271	0	1
Frac. unemployed f.	0.040	0.088	0	0.750
Frac. low skilled f.	0.140	0.154	0	1
Minority experience				
Frac. temp. foreigners	0.035	0.057	0	0.358
Frac. Italian speaking	0.108	0.270	0	0.948
Frac. Romansh speaking	0.265	0.322	0	0.956
Walser municipality	0.197	0.399	0	1
Political and power sharing preferences				
Frac. Social Democratic Party	0.209	0.102	0.027	0.561
Frac. Swiss People's Party	0.361	0.162	0.064	0.789
Reservations towards immigrants (1 st PC)	0.886	0.194	0.369	1.563
Frac. voting age 18 (1991)	0.756	0.100	0.453	1
Frac. Protestants	0.510	0.326	0	0.980

Note: The observations refer to the 208 municipalities in the canton. The detailed variable definitions can be found in Section D in the Appendix.

Data sources: Swiss Federal Statistical Office, Bureau of Municipalities of the Canton of Grisons.

Table E.2: Descriptive statistics of municipalities with and without non-citizen voting rights

Dependent variable	Mean	Std. dev.	Min	Max	Mean IVR=0	Mean IVR=100	Diff.	P-Value
Voting right for foreigners adopted by 2017 [0/100]	34.135	47.531	0	100	-	-	-	-
Independent / control variables								
Socio-economic composition								
Frac. age 0 to 34	0.412	0.059	0.198	0.536	0.414	0.407	0.008	0.376
Frac. age 65+	0.187	0.062	0.059	0.426	0.185	0.191	-0.006	0.488
Frac. low educated	0.350	0.104	0.161	0.727	0.348	0.357	-0.009	0.550
Frac. unemployed	0.018	0.017	0	0.094	0.019	0.017	0.002	0.416
Frac. high income	0.145	0.072	0	0.372	0.151	0.135	0.016	0.123
Power dilution								
Ln(population size)	5.875	1.258	3.135	10.381	6.064	5.511	0.552	0.002
Frac. foreigners	0.079	0.068	0	0.321	0.089	0.060	0.030	0.003
Municipality merger	0.587	0.494	0	1	0.467	0.817	-0.350	0.000
Municipal parliament	0.072	0.259	0	1	0.109	0	0.109	0.004
Minority experience								
Frac. Italian speaking	0.108	0.270	0	0.948	0.130	0.066	0.064	0.103
Frac. Romansh speaking	0.265	0.322	0	0.956	0.287	0.224	0.063	0.183
Walser municipality	0.197	0.399	0	1	0.168	0.254	-0.086	0.142
Political and power sharing preferences								
Frac. Social Democratic Party	0.209	0.102	0.027	0.561	0.205	0.216	-0.012	0.431
Frac. Swiss People's Party	0.361	0.162	0.064	0.789	0.340	0.402	-0.062	0.008
Reservations towards immigrants (1 st PC)	0.886	0.194	0.369	1.563	0.915	0.831	0.084	0.003
Frac. voting age 18 (1991)	0.756	0.100	0.453	1	0.742	0.783	-0.041	0.005
Frac. Protestants	0.510	0.326	0	0.980	0.468	0.591	-0.123	0.009

Notes: IVR indicates whether a municipality had introduced non-citizen voting rights by 2017. Zero indicates no non-citizen voting rights and 100 the introduction of voting rights. *Data sources:* Swiss Federal Statistical Office, Bureau of Municipalities of the Canton of Grisons.

Table E.3: Cross-correlation table for some control variables for the canton of Grisons

Variables	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)	(9)	(10)	(11)	(12)	(13)
(1) Ln(population size)	1.000												
(2) Frac. foreigners	0.511	1.000											
(3) Municipality merger	-0.361	-0.288	1.000										
(4) Municipal parliament	0.458	0.296	-0.219	1.000									
(5) Frac. temp. foreigners	0.055	0.271	0.039	0.139	1.000								
(6) Frac. Protestants	-0.149	-0.152	0.053	-0.260	0.052	1.000							
(7) Frac. Italien speaking	-0.026	0.181	-0.194	0.157	-0.141	-0.357	1.000						
(8) Frac. Romansh speaking	-0.095	-0.244	0.231	-0.016	-0.114	-0.334	-0.297	1.000					
(9) Walser municipality	-0.105	-0.076	0.220	-0.045	0.311	0.337	-0.192	-0.382	1.000				
(10) Frac. Social Democratic Party	0.083	0.159	-0.003	-0.066	-0.090	0.225	0.174	-0.354	-0.078	1.000			
(11) Frac. Swiss People's Party	-0.335	-0.177	0.060	-0.192	0.072	0.757	-0.301	-0.337	0.425	-0.135	1.000		
(12) Reservations towards immigrants (1 st PC)	-0.110	-0.239	-0.088	0.034	-0.290	-0.262	0.350	-0.037	-0.031	-0.292	-0.066	1.000	
(13) Frac. voting age 18 (1991)	-0.157	0.017	0.075	-0.196	0.157	0.240	-0.296	-0.144	0.148	0.170	0.182	-0.352	1.000

Table E.4: Descriptive statistics for the canton of Zurich

	No. of obs.	Mean	Std. dev.	Min	Max
Dependent variable					
Yes share voting rights [0/100]	310	20.822	5.019	6.84	43.42
Independent / control variables					
Socio-economic composition					
Frac. households 3+	310	0.387	0.069	0.198	0.566
Frac. age 0 to 39	310	0.495	0.056	0.368	0.641
Frac. age 65+	310	0.144	0.038	0.054	0.256
Frac. low educated Swiss	310	0.231	0.045	0.14	0.368
Frac. high income	310	0.402	0.097	0.172	0.686
Unemployment rate	310	0.014	0.006	0.001	0.039
Power dilution					
Ln(population size)	310	8.196	1.064	6.038	12.855
Frac. foreigners	310	0.156	0.078	0.01	0.453
Municipal parliament	155	0.081	0.273	0	1
Characteristics of foreigners					
Frac. low educated f.	310	0.460	0.123	0.125	0.743
Frac. unemployed f.	310	0.047	0.035	0	0.176
Frac. low skilled f.	310	0.371	0.134	0.080	0.769
Political and power sharing preferences					
Frac. Social Democratic Party	308	0.172	0.046	0.054	0.313
Frac. Swiss People's Party	308	0.366	0.092	0.169	0.64
Reservations towards immigrants (1 st PC)	310	1.391	0.148	1.063	1.759
Frac. voting age 18 (1991)	310	0.691	0.043	0.553	0.802

Note: The municipal structure refers to January 1, 2018 when there were 166 municipalities. For eleven of these municipalities there are missing data for the socio-economic composition. This occurs if the number of people sharing some characteristic is below a certain threshold, as the corresponding number is then not published. This leaves us with 155 municipalities and a main dataset of 310 observations. In addition, there is no information for the electoral result in Wiesendangen in 1993. This reduces the number of observations when including political party preferences to 308. Whenever applicable, the variable definitions follow those for the canton of Grisons described in Section D in the Appendix.

Data sources: Swiss Federal Statistical Office, Statistical Office Zurich

F Characteristics of foreigners and non-citizen voting rights in the cantons of Grisons and Zurich

Table F.1: Characteristics of foreigners and non-citizen voting rights in Grisons

Dependent variable	Voting right for foreigners adopted by 2017 [0/100]		
	(1)	(2)	(3)
Frac. foreigners high, dummy D_f	7.435 (10.556)	5.971 (10.027)	-2.038 (10.406)
Frac. low edu. f. high, dummy D_{ledu}	17.508* (10.003)		
Interaction $D_f \times D_{ledu}$	-23.948* (13.664)		
Frac. unempl. f. high, dummy D_{lue}		5.140 (12.173)	
Interaction $D_f \times D_{lue}$		-18.642 (15.129)	
Frac. low skilled f. high, dummy D_{lskill}			3.433 (11.064)
Interaction $D_f \times D_{lskill}$			-3.032 (14.310)
Municipality merger	28.712*** (7.236)	28.893*** (7.015)	29.499*** (7.024)
Ln(population size)	-5.252 (3.280)	-3.878 (3.527)	-5.543* (3.334)
Socio-economic composition	incl.	incl.	incl.
Constant	73.510 (58.229)	67.720 (57.592)	79.344 (58.750)
No. of obs.	208	208	208
$Adj.R^2$	0.10	0.10	0.09

Notes: Standard errors are heteroscedasticity-robust. Significance levels: * $.05 < p < .1$, ** $.01 < p < .05$, *** $p < .01$.

Data sources: Swiss Federal Statistical Office, Bureau of Municipalities of the Canton of Grisons.

Table F.2: Characteristics of foreigners and non-citizen voting rights in Zurich, 1993 and 2013

Dependent variable	Yes share [0/100]		
	(1)	(2)	(3)
Frac. foreigners high dummy D_f	-0.978 (1.161)	-1.108 (1.202)	-1.049 (1.142)
Frac. low educated f. high dummy D_{ledu}	0.227 (0.881)		
Interaction $D_f \times D_{\text{ledu}}$	-0.624 (1.183)		
Frac. unemployed f. high dummy D_{ue}		0.591 (0.717)	
Interaction $D_f \times D_{\text{ue}}$		-0.501 (0.912)	
Frac. low skilled f. high dummy D_{lskill}			0.213 (0.818)
Interaction $D_f \times D_{\text{lskill}}$			-0.560 (1.218)
Ln(population size)	-4.989** (2.266)	-4.917** (2.179)	-5.021** (2.238)
Socio-economic composition	incl.	incl.	incl.
Municipality FE	Yes	Yes	Yes
Year FE	Yes	Yes	Yes
No. of observations	310	310	310
No. of clusters	155	155	155
$Adj.R^2$	0.70	0.70	0.70

Notes: The mean of the dependent variable is 20.82. Standard errors in parentheses clustered at municipality level. Significance levels: * $.05 < p < .1$, ** $.01 < p < .05$, *** $p < .01$.

Data sources: Swiss Federal Statistical Office, Statistical Office Zurich.