

In the format provided by the authors and unedited.

Limits of conservation agriculture to overcome low crop yields in sub-Saharan Africa

Marc Corbeels ^{1,2}✉, Krishna Naudin ², Anthony M. Whitbread ³, Ronald Kühne⁴ and Philippe Letourmy²

¹Sustainable Intensification Program (SIP), International Maize and Wheat Improvement Center (CIMMYT), Nairobi, Kenya. ²Agro-ecology and Sustainable Intensification of Annual Crops (AIDA), French Agricultural Research Centre for International Development (CIRAD), University of Montpellier, Montpellier, France. ³Innovation Systems for the Drylands (ISD), International Crops Research Institute for the Semi-Arid Tropics (ICRISAT), Dar es Salaam, Tanzania. ⁴Tropical Plant Production and Agricultural Systems Modelling (TROPAGS), Georg August University of Göttingen, Göttingen, Germany. ✉e-mail: corbeels@cirad.fr

Limits of conservation agriculture to overcome low crop yields in Sub-Saharan Africa

Marc Corbeels^{1,2,*}, Krishna Naudin², Anthony M. Whitbread³, Ronald Kühne⁴ and Philippe Letourmy²

Supplementary Table 1.

Reference list of retrieved publications used in the meta-analysis

1. Abdul Rahman, N., Fosu, M., & Tetteh, F. M. Effect of tillage system and soil amendment on growth and yield of maize in northern Ghana. *J. Agron.* **13**, 79-84 (2014).
2. Agbede, T. M. & Ojeniyi, S. O. Tillage and poultry manure effects on soil fertility and sorghum yield in southwestern Nigeria. *Soil Tillage Res.* **104**, 74-81 (2009).
3. Agboola, A. A. The effects of different soil tillage and management practices on the physical and chemical properties of soil and maize yield in a rainforest zone of Western Nigeria. *Agron. J.* **73**, 247-251 (1981).
4. Ahamefule, E. H. & Peter, P. C. Cowpea (*Vigna unguiculata* (L.) Walp) response to phosphorus fertilizer under two tillage and mulch treatments. *Soil Tillage Res.* **136**, 70-75 (2014).
5. Anazodo, U. G. N., Onwualu, A. P. & Watts, K. C. Evaluation of alternative tillage systems in the absence of herbicides for maize production in a savannah loamy sand. *J. Agric. Eng. Res.* **49**, 259-272 (1991).
6. Baudron, F., Titttonell, P., Corbeels, M., Letourmy, P. & Giller, K. E. Comparative performance of conservation agriculture and current smallholder farming practices in semi-arid Zimbabwe. *Field Crops Res.* **132**, 117-128 (2012).
7. Busari, M. A. Soil physical properties in relation to maize (*Zea Mays*) yield after tillage and application of organic and inorganic fertilisers in Abeokuta, southwestern Nigeria. *Soil Res.* **55**, 704-714 (2017).
8. Dossou-Yovo, E. R., Brüggemann, N., Ampofo, E., Igue, A. M., Jesse, N., Huat, J., & Agbossou, E. K. Combining no-tillage, rice straw mulch and nitrogen fertilizer application to increase the soil carbon balance of upland rice field in northern Benin. *Soil Tillage Res.* **163**, 152-159 (2016).
9. Dusserre, J., Chopart, J.-L., Douzet, J.-M., Rakotoarisoa, J. & Scopel, E. Upland rice production under conservation agriculture cropping systems in cold conditions of tropical highlands. *Field Crops Res.* **138**, 33-41 (2012).
10. Dusserre, J., Raveloson, H., Michellon, R., Gozé, E., Auzoux, S., & Sester, M. Conservation agriculture cropping systems reduce blast disease in upland rice by affecting plant nitrogen nutrition. *Field Crops Res.* **204**, 208-221 (2017).
11. Enfors, E., Barron, J., Makurira, H., Rockström, J. & Tumbo, S. Yield and soil system changes from conservation tillage in dryland farming: A case study from North Eastern Tanzania. *Agr. Water Manage.* **98**, 1687-1695 (2011).
12. Gill, K. S., Arshad, M. A., Chivunda, B. K., Phiri, B. & Gumbo, M. Influence of residue mulch, tillage and cultural practices on weed mass and corn yield from three field experiments. *Soil Tillage Res.* **24**, 211-223 (1992).
13. Guto, S. N., Pypers, P., Vanlauwe, B., de Ridder, N. & Giller, K. E. Tillage and vegetative barrier effects on soil conservation and short-term economic benefits in the Central Kenya highlands. *Field Crops Res.* **122**, 85-94. (2011).
14. Ike, I. F. Soil and crop responses to different tillage practices in a ferruginous soil in the Nigerian savanna. *Soil Tillage Res.* **6**, 261-272 (1986).
15. Kafesu, N., Chikowo, R., Mazarura, U., Gwenzi, W., Snapp, S., & Zingore, S. Comparative fertilization effects on maize productivity under conservation and conventional tillage on

- sandy soils in a smallholder cropping system in Zimbabwe. *Field Crops Res.* **218**, 106-114 (2018).
16. Kang B. T. & Moody, K. & Adesina, J. O. Effects of fertilizer and weeding in no-tillage and tilled maize. *Fert. Res.* **1**, 87-93 (1980).
 17. Kang, B. T. & Yunusa, M. Effect of tillage methods and phosphorus fertilization on maize in the humid tropics. *Agron. J.* **69**, 291-294 (1977).
 18. Kayode, J. & Ademiluyi, B. Effect of tillage methods on weed control and maize performance in southwestern Nigeria location. *J. Sustain. Agr.* **23**, 39-45 (2004).
 19. Kayombo, B., Lal, R., Mrema, G. C. & Jensen, H. E. Characterizing compaction effects on soil properties and crop growth in southern Nigeria. *Soil Tillage Res.* **21**, 325-345 (1991).
 20. Khatibu, A. I., Lal, R. & Jana, R. K. Effects of tillage methods and mulching on erosion and physical properties of a sandy clay loam in an equatorial warm humid region. *Field Crops Res.* **8**, 239-254 (1984).
 21. Kiboi, M. N., Ngetich, K. F., Diels, J., Mucheru-Muna, M., Mugwe, J., & Mugendi, D. N. Minimum tillage, tied ridging and mulching for better maize yield and yield stability in the central highlands of Kenya. *Soil Tillage Res.* **170**, 157-166 (2017).
 22. Kihara, J., Bationo, A., Mugendi, D. N., Martius, C. & Vlek, P. L. G. Conservation tillage, local organic resources and nitrogen fertilizer combinations affect maize productivity, soil structure and nutrient balances in semi-arid Kenya. *Nutr. Cycl. Agroecosys.* **90**, 213-225 (2011).
 23. Kihara, J., Bationo, A., Waswa, B., Kimetu, J. M., Vanlauwe, B., Okeyo, J., Mukalama, J., Martius, C. Effect of reduced tillage and mineral fertilizer application on maize and soybean productivity. *Exp. Agric.* **48**, 159-175 (2012).
 24. Kimaro, A. A., Mpanda, M., Rioux, J., Aynekulu, E., Shaba, S., Thiong'o, M., Mutuo, P., Abwanda, S., Shepherd, K., Neufeldt, H., Rosenstock, T. S. Is conservation agriculture 'climate-smart' for maize farmers in the highlands of Tanzania? *Nutr. Cycl. Agroecosys.* **105**, 217-228 (2016).
 25. Kitonyo, O. M., Sadras, V. O., Zhou, Y., & Denton, M. D. Nitrogen fertilization modifies maize yield response to tillage and stubble in a sub-humid tropical environment. *Field Crops Res.* **223**, 113-124 (2018).
 26. Lal, R. Effects of eight tillage treatments on a tropical alfisol: Maize growth and yield. *J. Sci. Food Agric.* **37**, 1073-1082 (1986).
 27. Lasisi, D. & Aluko, O. B. Effects of tillage methods on soybean growth and yield in a tropical sandy loam soil. *Int. Agrophys.* **23**, 147-153 (2009).
 28. Liben, F. M., Hassen, S. J., Weyesa, B. T., Wortmann, C. S., Kim, H. K., Kidane, M. S., Yeda, G.G., Beshir, B. Conservation agriculture for maize and bean production in the central Rift Valley of Ethiopia. *Agron. J.* **109**, 2988-2997 (2017).
 29. Mashingaidze, N., Madakadze, C., Twomlow, S., Nyamangara, J. & Hove, L. Crop yield and weed growth under conservation agriculture in semi-arid Zimbabwe. *Soil Tillage Res.* **124**, 102-110 (2012).
 30. Masvaya, E. N., Nyamangara, J., Descheemaeker, K., & Giller, K. E. Tillage, mulch and fertiliser impacts on soil nitrogen availability and maize production in semi-arid Zimbabwe. *Soil Tillage Res.* **168**, 125-132 (2017).
 31. Materechera, S. A. & Mloza-Banda, H. R. Soil penetration resistance, root growth and yield of maize as influenced by tillage system on ridges in Malawi. *Soil Tillage Res.* **41**, 13-24 (1997).
 32. Mbagwu, J. S. C. Maize (*Zea mays*) response to nitrogen fertiliser on an ultisol in southern Nigeria under two tillage and mulch treatments. *J. Sci. Food Agric.* **52**, 365-376 (1990).

33. McHugh, O. V., Steenhuis, T. S., Abebe, B. & Fernandes, E. C. M. Performance of in situ rainwater conservation tillage techniques on dry spell mitigation and erosion control in the drought-prone North Wello zone of the Ethiopian highlands. *Soil Tillage Res.* **97**, 19-36 (2007).
34. Mesfine, T., Abebe, G. & Al-Tawaha, A.-R. M. Effect of reduced tillage and crop residue ground cover on yield and water use efficiency of sorghum (*Sorghum bicolor* (L.) Moench) under semi-arid conditions of Ethiopia. *World J. Agric. Res.* **1**, 152-160 (2005).
35. Micheni, A. N., Kanampiu, F., Kitonyo, O., Mburu, D. M., Mugai, E. N., Makumbi, D., & Kassie, M. On-farm experimentation on conservation agriculture in maize-legume based cropping systems in Kenya: Water use efficiency and economic impacts. *Exp. Agric.* **52**, 51-68 (2016).
36. Muoni, T., Mhlanga, B., Forkman, J., Sitali, M., & Thierfelder, C. Tillage and crop rotations enhance populations of earthworms, termites, dung beetles and centipedes: Evidence from a long-term trial in Zambia. *J. Agric. Sci.* **157**, 504-514 (2019).
37. Mupangwa, W., Nyagumbo, I., & Mutsamba, E. Effect of different mulching materials on maize growth and yield in conservation agriculture systems of sub-humid Zimbabwe. *AIMS Agric. Food* **1**, 239-253. (2016).
38. Mupangwa, W., Nyagumbo, I., Mutsamba, E., Mhlanga, B., & Mataruse, J. Maize responses to reduced tillage, different plant residue mulch and nitrogen fertiliser on granitic sandy soils of Zimbabwe. *S. Afr. J. Plant Soil*, **35**, 367-376 (2018).
39. Mupangwa, W., Twomlow, S., Walker, S. & Hove, L. Effect of minimum tillage and mulching on maize (*Zea mays* L.) yield and water content of clayey and sandy soils. *Phys. Chem. Earth* **32**, 1127-1134 (2007).
40. Mutsamba, E. F., Nyagumbo, I., & Mafongoya, P. Termite prevalence and crop lodging under conservation agriculture in sub-humid Zimbabwe. *Crop Prot.* **82**, 60-64 (2016).
41. Naab, J. B., Mahama, G. Y., Yahaya, I., & Prasad, P. V. V. Conservation agriculture improves soil quality, crop yield, and incomes of smallholder farmers in north western Ghana. *Front. Plant Sci.* **8**, 996 (2017).
42. Nansamba, A., Kaizzi, K. C., Twaha, A. B., Ebanyat, P., & Wortmann, C. S. Grain sorghum response to reduced tillage, rotation, and soil fertility management in Uganda. *Agron. J.* **108**, 2137-2146 (2016).
43. Ndoli, A., Baudron, F., Sida, T. S., Schut, A. G. T., van Heerwaarden, J., & Giller, K. E. Conservation agriculture with trees amplifies negative effects of reduced tillage on maize performance in East Africa. *Field Crops Res.* **221**, 238-244 (2018).
44. Ngetich, K. F. *et al.* Effects of selected soil and water conservation techniques on runoff, sediment yield and maize productivity under sub-humid and semi-arid conditions in Kenya. *Catena* **121**, 288-296 (2014).
45. Ngwira, A. R., Aune, J. B. & Mkwinda, S. On-farm evaluation of yield and economic benefit of short term maize legume intercropping systems under conservation agriculture in Malawi. *Field Crops Res.* **132**, 149-157 (2012).
46. Ngwira, A. R., Aune, J. B., & Thierfelder, C. (2014). On-farm evaluation of the effects of the principles and components of conservation agriculture on maize yield and weed biomass in Malawi. *Exp. Agric.* **50**, 591-610 (2014).
47. Nyagumbo, I., Mkuhlani, S., Pisa, C., Kamalongo, D., Dias, D., & Mekuria, M. Maize yield effects of conservation agriculture based maize-legume cropping systems in contrasting agro-ecologies of Malawi and Mozambique. *Nutr. Cycl. Agroecosys.* **105**, 275-290 (2016).

48. Nyagumbo, I., Munamati, M., Mutsamba, E. F., Thierfelder, C., Cumbane, A., & Dias, D. The effects of tillage, mulching and termite control strategies on termite activity and maize yield under conservation agriculture in Mozambique. *Crop Prot.* **78**, 54-62 (2015).
49. Obalum, S. E., Amalu, U. C., Obi, M. E. & Wakatsuki, T. Soil water balance and grain yield of sorghum under no-till versus conventional tillage with surface mulch in the derived savanna zone of southeastern Nigeria. *Exp. Agric.* **47**, 89-109 (2011).
50. Ogunremi, L. T., Lal, R. & Babalola, O. Effects of tillage and seeding methods on soil physical properties and yield of upland rice for an ultisol in southeast Nigeria. *Soil Tillage Res.* **6**, 305-324 (1986).
51. Ojeniyi, S. O. Nutrient availability and maize yield under reduced tillage practices. *Soil Tillage Res.* **26**, 89-92 (1993).
52. Ojeniyi, S. O. & Adekayode, F. O. Soil conditions and cowpea and maize yield produced by tillage methods in the rainforest zone of Nigeria. *Soil Tillage Res.* **51**, 161-164 (1999).
53. Okeyo, A. I. *et al.* Effects of selected soil and water conservation technologies on nutrient losses and maize yields in the central highlands of Kenya. *Agr. Water Manage.* **137**, 52-58 (2014).
54. Okoth, J. O., Mungai, N. W., Ouma, J. P., & Baijukya, F. P. Effect of tillage on biological nitrogen fixation and yield of soybean (*Glycine max* L. merril) varieties. *Austr. J. Crop Sci.* **8**, 1140-1146 (2014).
55. Olaoye, J. O. Influence of tillage on crop residue cover, soil properties and yield components of cowpea in derived savannah ectones of Nigeria. *Soil Tillage Res.* **64**, 179-187 (2002).
56. Olofintoye J. A. T. The influence of different tillage methods and pre-emergence herbicides on weeds and the growth and yield of soyabean in the Guinea savanna of Nigeria. *Environ. Educ. Inf.* **16**, 407-416 (1997).
57. Omer, M. A. & Elamin, E. M. Effect of tillage and contour diking on sorghum establishment and yield on sandy clay soil in Sudan. *Soil Tillage Res.* **43**, 229-240 (1997).
58. Osuji, G. E. Water storage, water use and maize yield for tillage systems on a tropical alfisol in Nigeria. *Soil Tillage Res.* **4**, 339-348 (1984).
59. Osuji G.E. Zero-tillage for erosion control and maize production in the humid tropics. *J. Environ. Manage.* **23**, 193-201 (1986).
60. Ouédraogo, E., Stroosnijder, L., Mando, A., Brussaard, L. & Zougmore, R. Agroecological analysis and economic benefit of organic resources and fertiliser in till and no-till sorghum production after a 6-year fallow in semi-arid West Africa. *Nutr. Cycl. Agroecosys.* **77**, 245-256 (2007).
61. Paul, B. K. *et al.* Medium-term impact of tillage and residue management on soil aggregate stability, soil carbon and crop productivity. *Agric. Ecosyst. Environ.* **164**, 14-22 (2013).
62. Paul, B. K., Vanlauwe, B., Hoogmoed, M., Hurisso, T. T., Ndabamenye, T., Terano, Y., Six, J., Ayuke, F.O., Pulleman, M. M. Exclusion of soil macrofauna did not affect soil quality but increased crop yields in a sub-humid tropical maize-based system. *Agric. Ecosyst. Environ.* **208**, 75-85 (2015).
63. Ranaivoson, L., Naudin, K., Ripoche, A., Rabeharisoa, L., & Corbeels, M. Effectiveness of conservation agriculture in increasing crop productivity in low-input rainfed rice cropping systems under humid subtropical climate. *Field Crops Res.* **239**, 104-113 (2019).
64. Rusinamhodzi, L., Makoko, B., & Sariah, J. Ratooning pigeonpea in maize-pigeonpea intercropping: Productivity and seed cost reduction in eastern Tanzania. *Field Crops Res.* **203**, 24-32 (2017).

65. Sester, M., Raveloson, H., Tharreau, D., & Dusserre, J. Conservation agriculture cropping system to limit blast disease in upland rainfed rice. *Plant Pathol.* **63**, 373-381 (2014).
66. Shemdoe, R. S., Van Damme, P. & Kikula, I. S. Increasing crop yield in water scarce environments using locally available materials: An experience from semi-arid areas in Mpwapwa District, central Tanzania. *Agr. Water Manage.* **96**, 963-968 (2009).
67. Soremi, P. A. S., Sakariyawo, O. S., Okeleye, K. A., Olowe, V. I., Azeez, J. O., Nwilene, F., & Aderibigbe, S. G. Yield response and economic implications of soybean (*Glycine max* (L.) merrill) - upland-lowland rice sequential cropping in the rainforest/savanna transitory ecosystem. *Acta Agric. Slov.* **109**, 529-543 (2017).
68. Steward, P. R., Thierfelder, C., Dougill, A. J., & Ligowe, I. Conservation agriculture enhances resistance of maize to climate stress in a Malawian medium-term trial. *Agric. Ecosyst. Environ.* **277**, 95-104 (2019).
69. TerAvest, D., Carpenter-Boggs, L., Thierfelder, C., & Reganold, J. P. Crop production and soil water management in conservation agriculture, no-till, and conventional tillage systems in Malawi. *Agric. Ecosyst. Environ.* **212**, 285-296 (2015).
70. Thierfelder, C. & Wall, P. C. Effects of conservation agriculture on soil quality and productivity in contrasting agro-ecological environments of Zimbabwe. *Soil Use Manage.* **28**, 209-220 (2012).
71. Thierfelder, C., Bunderson, W. T., Jere, Z. D., Mutenje, M., & Ngwira, A. Development of conservation agriculture (CA) systems in Malawi: Lessons learned from 2005 to 2014. *Exp. Agric.* **52**, 579-604 (2016).
72. Thierfelder, C., Cheesman, S. & Rusinamhodzi, L. A comparative analysis of conservation agriculture systems: Benefits and challenges of rotations and intercropping in Zimbabwe. *Field Crops Res.* **137**, 237-250 (2012).
73. Thierfelder, C. *et al.* Maize-based conservation agriculture systems in Malawi: Long-term trends in productivity. *Field Crops Res.* **142**, 47-57 (2013).
74. Thierfelder, C., Mombeyarara, T., Mango, N. & Rusinamhodzi, L. Integration of conservation agriculture in smallholder farming systems of southern Africa: identification of key entry points. *Int. J. Agr. Sustain.* **11**, 317-330 (2013).
75. Thierfelder, C., Mutenje, M., Mujeyi, A., & Mupangwa, W. Where is the limit? Lessons learned from long-term conservation agriculture research in Zimuto communal area, Zimbabwe. *Food Secur.* **7**, 15-31 (2014).
76. Thierfelder, C., Mwila, M. & Rusinamhodzi, L. Conservation agriculture in eastern and southern provinces of Zambia: Long-term effects on soil quality and maize productivity. *Soil Tillage Res.* **126**, 246-258 (2013).
77. Thierfelder, C., Rusinamhodzi, L., Ngwira, A. R., Mupangwa, W., Nyagumbo, I., Kassie, G. T., & Cairns, J. E. Conservation agriculture in southern Africa: Advances in knowledge. *Renew. Agr. Food Syst.* **30**, 328-348 (2015).
78. Van Nguu, N. Effect of nitrogen, phosphorus and soil and crop residues management practices on maize (*Zea mays* L.) yield in ultisol of eastern Cameroon. *Fert. Res.* **14**, 135-142 (1987).
79. Vogel, H. Tillage effects on maize yield, rooting depth and soil water content on sandy soils in Zimbabwe. *Field Crops Res.* **33**, 367-384. (1993).

Reference list of retrieved publications not used in meta-analysis because the studied crop species in these publications had few observations in total, resulting in confounding effects.

1. Adimassu, Z., Alemu, G., & Tamene, L. Effects of tillage and crop residue management on runoff, soil loss and crop yield in the humid highlands of Ethiopia. *Agric. Syst.* **168**, 11-18 (2019).
2. Araya, T. *et al.* Medium-term effects of conservation agriculture based cropping systems for sustainable soil and water management and crop productivity in the Ethiopian highlands. *Field Crops Res.* **132**, 53-62 (2012).
3. Araya, T., Nyssen, J., Govaerts, B., Deckers, J., Sommer, R., Bauer, H., Gebrehiwot, K., Cornelis, W. M. Seven years resource-conserving agriculture effect on soil quality and crop productivity in the Ethiopian drylands. *Soil Tillage Res.* **163**, 99-109 (2016).
4. Bielders, C. L. & Michels, K. On-farm evaluation of ridging and residue management options in a Sahelian millet-cowpea intercrop. 2. Crop development. *Soil Use Manage.* **18**, 309-315 (2002).
5. Gebru, A. A., Araya, T., Wolde-Georgis, T., Nyssen, J. A. N., Baudron, F., Verhulst, N., Speratti, A.B., Govaerts, B. Implementation of permanent raised beds contributes to increased crop yield and profitability in the northeastern Tigray region, Ethiopia. *Exp. Agric.* **55**, 807-817 (2019).
6. Gill, K. S. & Aulakh, B. S. Wheat yield and soil bulk density response to some tillage systems on an oxisol. *Soil Tillage Res.* **18**, 37-45 (1990).
7. Oicha, T. *et al.* Short-term effects of conservation agriculture on Vertisols under tef (*Eragrostis tef* (Zucc.) Trotter) in the northern Ethiopian highlands. *Soil Tillage Res.* **106**, 294-302 (2010).
8. Tulema, B., Aune, J. B., Johnsen, F. H. & Vanlauwe, B. The prospects of reduced tillage in tef (*Eragrostis tef* Zucca) in Gare Arera, West Shawa zone of Oromiya, Ethiopia. *Soil Tillage Res.* **99**, 58-65 (2008).