



Open Access This file is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License, which permits use, sharing, adaptation, distribution and reproduction in any medium or format, as long as you give appropriate credit to the original author(s) and the source, provide a link to the Creative Commons license, and indicate if changes were made. In the cases where the authors are anonymous, such as is the case for the reports of anonymous peer reviewers, author attribution should be to 'Anonymous Referee' followed by a clear attribution to the source work. The images or other third party material in this file are included in the article's Creative Commons license, unless indicated otherwise in a credit line to the material. If material is not included in the article's Creative Commons license and your intended use is not permitted by statutory regulation or exceeds the permitted use, you will need to obtain permission directly from the copyright holder. To view a copy of this license, visit <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>.

Web links to the author's journal account have been redacted from the decision letters as indicated to maintain confidentiality

This manuscript has been previously reviewed at another Nature Portfolio journal. This document only contains reviewer comments and rebuttal letters for versions considered at Communications Earth & Environment

16th Feb 24

Dear Mr Andrieu,

Please allow me to apologise once again for the delay. Your manuscript titled "Mapping global greenhouse gases emissions: an open access web application" has now been seen by the original reviewer 2 (who previously reviewed the manuscript for another Nature Portfolio journal) and a new reviewer 3; their comments appear below. In light of their assessments of the academic strength of your article, we cannot offer publication of your manuscript as an ARTICLE (that is, as primary research) in Communications Earth & Environment.

However, taking into account the reviewers' interest in your data visualisation and their assessment of the potential interest and practical value of your tool, we are pleased to say that we are happy, in principle, to publish a suitably revised version as a PERSPECTIVE in Communications Earth & Environment under the open access CC BY license (Creative Commons Attribution v4.0 International License).

We therefore invite you to revise your paper one last time to edit your manuscript to comply with our format requirements and to maximise the accessibility and therefore the impact of your work.

EDITORIAL REQUESTS:

Please review our specific editorial comments and requests regarding your manuscript in the attached "Editorial Requests Table", and resubmit your manuscript as a "Perspective".

*****Please take care to match our formatting and policy requirements. We will check revised manuscript and return manuscripts that do not comply. Such requests will lead to delays. *****

Please outline your response to each request in the right hand column. Please upload the completed table with your manuscript files as a Related Manuscript file.

If you have any questions or concerns about any of our requests, please do not hesitate to contact me.

SUBMISSION INFORMATION:

In order to accept your paper, we require the files listed at the end of the Editorial Requests Table; the list of required files is also available at <https://www.nature.com/documents/commsj-file-checklist.pdf>.

OPEN ACCESS:

Communications Earth & Environment is a fully open access journal. Articles are made freely accessible on publication under a [CC BY license](#) (Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License). This license allows maximum dissemination and re-use of open access materials and is preferred by many research funding bodies.

For further information about article processing charges, open access funding, and advice and support from Nature Research, please visit <https://www.nature.com/commsenv/article-processing-charges>

At acceptance, you will be provided with instructions for completing this CC BY license on behalf of all authors. This grants us the necessary permissions to publish your paper. Additionally, you will be asked to declare that all required third party permissions have been obtained, and to provide billing information in order to pay the article-processing charge (APC).

Please use the following link to submit the above items:

[link redacted]

** This url links to your confidential home page and associated information about manuscripts you may have submitted or be reviewing for us. If you wish to forward this email to co-authors, please delete the link to your homepage first **

We hope to hear from you within two weeks; please let us know if you need more time.

Best regards,

Heike Langenberg, PhD
Chief Editor
Communications Earth & Environment

On Twitter: @CommsEarth

REVIEWERS' COMMENTS:

Reviewer #2 (Remarks to the Author):

As in my original comment, I think this paper is basically not a scientific contribution. It is documentation for a nice communication tool. There are no novel methods or results. In today's world the line between blog post and scientific article is blurring, and there is a fear that the ballooning number of articles accepted for publication in scientific journals will undermine credibility in scientific journals.

The journal's statement is to publish "research.. that will influence the thinking...". I'm not sure if this paper counts as research, but it can influence thinking. So this paper may fit the mission.

My role as a reviewer is to ensure the paper does not contain errors and is reproducible. If the editorial decision is that the paper passes the novelty and significance tests for the journal, then it can be accepted.

Reviewer #3 (Remarks to the Author):

The authors used MRIO (EXIOBASE) to visualize PBAs, CBAs, and CBAk for 49 regions of the world from 1995 to 2019 with a Sankey diagrams, which were published and made available as an open access web application. The practical value of this contribution is enormous, and the authors have developed a tool that will be widely useful not only to global warming researchers but also to policy makers. However, it must be said that the author has only technically implemented already established methods as programming code and visualized results that a technical person could derive, and his academic contribution is unfortunately scant.